

# $C(K)$ -spaces in the twisted realm

Alberto Salguero Alarcón

University of Extremadura

Workshop on Banach Spaces and Banach Lattices II

9th - 13th May 2022

This activity has been supported by projects PID-2019-103961GB-C21 funded by MCIN/AEI/10.13039/501100011033, by an FPU Grant FPU18-00990 funded by MCIN/AEI/10.13039/501100011033 and FSE Invierte en tu futuro, and by the project IB20038 funded by Junta de Extremadura.



# Outline

- 1 Preliminaries
- 2 A counterexample for the complemented subspace problem
- 3 Open problems

# Spaces of continuous functions

- $K$  compact Hausdorff space.

$$C(K) = \{f : K \rightarrow \mathbb{R} \text{ continuous}\} \quad , \quad \|f\| = \max_{t \in K} |f(t)|$$

# Spaces of continuous functions

- $K$  compact Hausdorff space.

$$C(K) = \{f : K \rightarrow \mathbb{R} \text{ continuous}\} \quad , \quad \|f\| = \max_{t \in K} |f(t)|$$

- Riesz representation theorem:

$$C(K)^* = M(K) = \{\text{regular Borel signed measures on } K\}$$

# Spaces of continuous functions

- $K$  compact Hausdorff space.

$$C(K) = \{f : K \rightarrow \mathbb{R} \text{ continuous}\} \quad , \quad \|f\| = \max_{t \in K} |f(t)|$$

- Riesz representation theorem:

$$C(K)^* = M(K) = \{\text{regular Borel signed measures on } K\}$$

- $M_1(K) = (B_{M(K)}, w^*)$ .

# Spaces of continuous functions

- $K$  compact Hausdorff space.

$$C(K) = \{f : K \rightarrow \mathbb{R} \text{ continuous}\} \quad , \quad \|f\| = \max_{t \in K} |f(t)|$$

- Riesz representation theorem:

$$C(K)^* = M(K) = \{\text{regular Borel signed measures on } K\}$$

- $M_1(K) = (B_{M(K)}, w^*)$ .

## Definition

A  $\mathcal{C}$ -space is a Banach space which is isomorphic to a space  $C(K)$  for some compact Hausdorff space  $K$ .

# Exact sequences

$$0 \longrightarrow Y \xrightarrow{i} Z \xrightarrow{q} X \longrightarrow 0$$

# Exact sequences

$$0 \longrightarrow Y \xrightarrow{i} Z \xrightarrow{q} X \longrightarrow 0$$

- $i$  is an into isomorphism.



# Exact sequences

$$0 \longrightarrow Y \xrightarrow{i} Z \xrightarrow{q} X \longrightarrow 0$$

- $i$  is an into isomorphism.
- $q$  is a quotient operator.

# Exact sequences

$$0 \longrightarrow Y \xrightarrow{i} Z \xrightarrow{q} X \longrightarrow 0$$

- $i$  is an into isomorphism.
- $q$  is a quotient operator.
- $Z/i(Y) \simeq X$ .

# Exact sequences

$$0 \longrightarrow Y \xrightarrow{i} Z \xrightarrow{q} X \longrightarrow 0$$

- $i$  is an into isomorphism.
- $q$  is a quotient operator.
- $Z/i(Y) \simeq X$ .

We say  $Z$  is a *twisted sum* of  $Y$  and  $X$ .

# Exact sequences

$$0 \longrightarrow Y \xrightarrow{i} Z \xrightarrow{q} X \longrightarrow 0$$

- $i$  is an into isomorphism.
- $q$  is a quotient operator.
- $Z/i(Y) \simeq X$ .

We say  $Z$  is a *twisted sum* of  $Y$  and  $X$ .

## Definition

A twisted sum  $Z$  is *trivial* if  $i(Y)$  is complemented in  $Z$ .

$$0 \longrightarrow Y \xrightarrow{i} Y \oplus X \xrightarrow{q} X \longrightarrow 0$$

# The principal actor

*Alexandroff-Urysohn compacta:*

$$K_{\mathcal{A}} = \mathbb{N} \cup \{A : A \in \mathcal{A}\} \cup \{\infty\}$$

# The principal actor

*Alexandroff-Urysohn compacta:*

$$K_{\mathcal{A}} = \mathbb{N} \cup \{A : A \in \mathcal{A}\} \cup \{\infty\}$$

☞ If  $|\mathcal{A}|$  is uncountable, there is a non-trivial exact sequence

$$0 \longrightarrow c_0 \longrightarrow C_0(K_{\mathcal{A}}) \longrightarrow c_0(\mathcal{A}) \longrightarrow 0$$

# Spaces of ultrafilters

# Spaces of ultrafilters

Let  $\mathfrak{B}$  be a subalgebra of  $\mathcal{P}(\mathbb{N})$ .



# Spaces of ultrafilters

Let  $\mathfrak{B}$  be a subalgebra of  $\mathcal{P}(\mathbb{N})$ .

## Definition

An *ultrafilter* on  $\mathfrak{B}$  is a family  $\mathcal{F}$  of elements of  $\mathfrak{B}$  such that:

# Spaces of ultrafilters

Let  $\mathfrak{B}$  be a subalgebra of  $\mathcal{P}(\mathbb{N})$ .

## Definition

An *ultrafilter* on  $\mathfrak{B}$  is a family  $\mathcal{F}$  of elements of  $\mathfrak{B}$  such that:

1.  $\mathbb{N} \in \mathcal{F}$ .

# Spaces of ultrafilters

Let  $\mathfrak{B}$  be a subalgebra of  $\mathcal{P}(\mathbb{N})$ .

## Definition

An *ultrafilter* on  $\mathfrak{B}$  is a family  $\mathcal{F}$  of elements of  $\mathfrak{B}$  such that:

1.  $\mathbb{N} \in \mathcal{F}$ .
2.  $A \in \mathcal{F}, B \supseteq A \Rightarrow B \in \mathcal{F}$ .

# Spaces of ultrafilters

Let  $\mathfrak{B}$  be a subalgebra of  $\mathcal{P}(\mathbb{N})$ .

## Definition

An *ultrafilter* on  $\mathfrak{B}$  is a family  $\mathcal{F}$  of elements of  $\mathfrak{B}$  such that:

1.  $\mathbb{N} \in \mathcal{F}$ .
2.  $A \in \mathcal{F}, B \supseteq A \Rightarrow B \in \mathcal{F}$ .
3.  $A, B \in \mathcal{F} \Rightarrow A \cap B \in \mathcal{F}$ .

# Spaces of ultrafilters

Let  $\mathfrak{B}$  be a subalgebra of  $\mathcal{P}(\mathbb{N})$ .

## Definition

An *ultrafilter* on  $\mathfrak{B}$  is a family  $\mathcal{F}$  of elements of  $\mathfrak{B}$  such that:

1.  $\mathbb{N} \in \mathcal{F}$ .
2.  $A \in \mathcal{F}, B \supseteq A \Rightarrow B \in \mathcal{F}$ .
3.  $A, B \in \mathcal{F} \Rightarrow A \cap B \in \mathcal{F}$ .
4.  $A_1 \cup \dots \cup A_n \in \mathcal{F} \Rightarrow \exists i \in \{1, \dots, n\} : A_i \in \mathcal{F}$

# Spaces of ultrafilters

Let  $\mathfrak{B}$  be a subalgebra of  $\mathcal{P}(\mathbb{N})$ .

## Definition

An *ultrafilter* on  $\mathfrak{B}$  is a family  $\mathcal{F}$  of elements of  $\mathfrak{B}$  such that:

1.  $\mathbb{N} \in \mathcal{F}$ .
2.  $A \in \mathcal{F}, B \supseteq A \Rightarrow B \in \mathcal{F}$ .
3.  $A, B \in \mathcal{F} \Rightarrow A \cap B \in \mathcal{F}$ .
4.  $A_1 \cup \dots \cup A_n \in \mathcal{F} \Rightarrow \exists i \in \{1, \dots, n\} : A_i \in \mathcal{F}$

*Notation:*  $\text{ult}(\mathfrak{B}) = \{\text{ultrafilters on } \mathfrak{B}\}$  is the *Stone space* associated to  $\mathfrak{B}$ .

$$\widehat{B} = \{p \in \text{ult}(\mathfrak{B}) : B \in p\}, \quad B \in \mathfrak{B}$$

# Pocket dictionary

# Pocket dictionary

☞ If  $\mathcal{A}$  is an almost-disjoint family, then

$$K_{\mathcal{A}} = \text{ult}(\mathfrak{A})$$

where  $\mathfrak{A}$  is the subalgebra generated by  $\mathcal{A}$  and finite sets of  $\mathbb{N}$ .



# Pocket dictionary

☞ If  $\mathcal{A}$  is an almost-disjoint family, then

$$K_{\mathcal{A}} = \text{ult}(\mathfrak{A})$$

where  $\mathfrak{A}$  is the subalgebra generated by  $\mathcal{A}$  and finite sets of  $\mathbb{N}$ .

$\mathcal{A}$  almost disjoint family  $\iff \mathfrak{A}$  subalgebra generated by  $\mathcal{A}$   
and finite sets

# Pocket dictionary

☞ If  $\mathcal{A}$  is an almost-disjoint family, then

$$K_{\mathcal{A}} = \text{ult}(\mathfrak{A})$$

where  $\mathfrak{A}$  is the subalgebra generated by  $\mathcal{A}$  and finite sets of  $\mathbb{N}$ .

$\mathcal{A}$  almost disjoint family  $\iff \mathfrak{A}$  subalgebra generated by  $\mathcal{A}$   
and finite sets

$$K_{\mathcal{A}} \iff \text{ult}(\mathfrak{A})$$

# The complemented subspace problem

# The complemented subspace problem

☞ *Is every complemented subspace of a  $\mathcal{C}$ -space again a  $\mathcal{C}$ -space?*

# The complemented subspace problem

☞ *Is every complemented subspace of a  $\mathcal{C}$ -space again a  $\mathcal{C}$ -space?*

Theorem (Plebanek, S-A., 2022)

*There are two almost disjoint families  $\mathcal{A}, \mathcal{B}$  so that*

$$C(K_{\mathcal{B}}) = C(K_{\mathcal{A}}) \oplus Z$$

*and  $Z$  is not a  $\mathcal{C}$ -space.*

# The complemented subspace problem

☞ *Is every complemented subspace of a  $\mathcal{C}$ -space again a  $\mathcal{C}$ -space?*

Theorem (Plebanek, S-A., 2022)

*There are two almost disjoint families  $\mathcal{A}, \mathcal{B}$  so that*

$$C(K_{\mathcal{B}}) = C(K_{\mathcal{A}}) \oplus Z$$

*and  $Z$  is not a  $\mathcal{C}$ -space.*

*We will show:* how to construct  $Z$  so that it is not a  $\mathcal{C}$ -space.

# Norming and free subsets

# Norming and free subsets

Every weak\* compact subset  $K \subseteq B_{X^*}$  defines

$$T : X \rightarrow C(K) \quad , \quad T(x)(x^*) = \langle x^*, x \rangle$$



# Norming and free subsets

Every weak\* compact subset  $K \subseteq B_{X^*}$  defines

$$T : X \rightarrow C(K) \quad , \quad T(x)(x^*) = \langle x^*, x \rangle$$

We say  $K$  is:

- *c-norming* for some  $0 < c \leq 1$  if  $T$  is an isomorphic embedding with  $\|T^{-1}\| \leq \frac{1}{c}$ .

# Norming and free subsets

Every weak\* compact subset  $K \subseteq B_{X^*}$  defines

$$T : X \rightarrow C(K) \quad , \quad T(x)(x^*) = \langle x^*, x \rangle$$

We say  $K$  is:

- *c-norming* for some  $0 < c \leq 1$  if  $T$  is an isomorphic embedding with  $\|T^{-1}\| \leq \frac{1}{c}$ .

$$c \cdot \sup_{x^* \in K} |\langle x^*, x \rangle| \leq \|x\|_X$$

# Norming and free subsets

Every weak\* compact subset  $K \subseteq B_{X^*}$  defines

$$T : X \rightarrow C(K) \quad , \quad T(x)(x^*) = \langle x^*, x \rangle$$

We say  $K$  is:

- *c-norming* for some  $0 < c \leq 1$  if  $T$  is an isomorphic embedding with  $\|T^{-1}\| \leq \frac{1}{c}$ .

$$c \cdot \sup_{x^* \in K} |\langle x^*, x \rangle| \leq \|x\|_X$$

- *free* if  $T$  is onto.

# Norming and free subsets

Every weak\* compact subset  $K \subseteq B_{X^*}$  defines

$$T : X \rightarrow C(K) \quad , \quad T(x)(x^*) = \langle x^*, x \rangle$$

We say  $K$  is:

- *c-norming* for some  $0 < c \leq 1$  if  $T$  is an isomorphic embedding with  $\|T^{-1}\| \leq \frac{1}{c}$ .

$$c \cdot \sup_{x^* \in K} |\langle x^*, x \rangle| \leq \|x\|_X$$

- *free* if  $T$  is onto. That is, given  $f \in C(K)$ , there is  $x \in X$  so that  $f(x^*) = \langle x^*, x \rangle$ .

# Norming and free subsets

Every weak\* compact subset  $K \subseteq B_{X^*}$  defines

$$T : X \rightarrow C(K) \quad , \quad T(x)(x^*) = \langle x^*, x \rangle$$

We say  $K$  is:

- *c-norming* for some  $0 < c \leq 1$  if  $T$  is an isomorphic embedding with  $\|T^{-1}\| \leq \frac{1}{c}$ .

$$c \cdot \sup_{x^* \in K} |\langle x^*, x \rangle| \leq \|x\|_X$$

- *free* if  $T$  is onto. That is, given  $f \in C(K)$ , there is  $x \in X$  so that  $f(x^*) = \langle x^*, x \rangle$ .

## Proposition

$X$  is a  $\mathcal{C}$ -space if and only if there is a weak\* compact set  $K \subseteq B_{X^*}$  which is norming and free.

# Norming and free subsets

# Norming and free subsets

## Key Lemma 1

Let  $\mathfrak{B}$  be a subalgebra and  $Z \in \mathfrak{B}$ . If  $M \subseteq M_1(\text{ult}(\mathfrak{B}))$  lies on a free set, for every  $\varepsilon > 0$  there is a simple  $\mathfrak{B}$ -measurable function

$$g = \sum_{i=1}^n a_i \cdot 1_{B_i} \in C(\text{ult}(\mathfrak{B}))$$

so that  $||\mu(Z)| - \langle \mu, g \rangle| < \varepsilon$  for every  $\mu \in M$ .

# Norming and free subsets

## Key Lemma 1

Let  $\mathfrak{B}$  be a subalgebra and  $Z \in \mathfrak{B}$ . If  $M \subseteq M_1(\text{ult}(\mathfrak{B}))$  lies on a free set, for every  $\varepsilon > 0$  there is a simple  $\mathfrak{B}$ -measurable function

$$g = \sum_{i=1}^n a_i \cdot 1_{B_i} \in C(\text{ult}(\mathfrak{B}))$$

so that  $||\mu(Z)| - \langle \mu, g \rangle| < \varepsilon$  for every  $\mu \in M$ .

*Proof:*

- The function  $\mu \mapsto |\mu(Z)|$  is continuous.



# Norming and free subsets

## Key Lemma 1

Let  $\mathfrak{B}$  be a subalgebra and  $Z \in \mathfrak{B}$ . If  $M \subseteq M_1(\text{ult}(\mathfrak{B}))$  lies on a free set, for every  $\varepsilon > 0$  there is a simple  $\mathfrak{B}$ -measurable function

$$g = \sum_{i=1}^n a_i \cdot 1_{B_i} \in C(\text{ult}(\mathfrak{B}))$$

so that  $||\mu(Z)| - \langle \mu, g \rangle| < \varepsilon$  for every  $\mu \in M$ .

*Proof:*

- The function  $\mu \mapsto |\mu(Z)|$  is continuous.
- There is  $h \in C(\text{ult}(\mathfrak{B}))$  so that  $|\mu(Z)| = \langle \mu, h \rangle$  for  $\mu \in M$ .

# Norming and free subsets

## Key Lemma 1

Let  $\mathfrak{B}$  be a subalgebra and  $Z \in \mathfrak{B}$ . If  $M \subseteq M_1(\text{ult}(\mathfrak{B}))$  lies on a free set, for every  $\varepsilon > 0$  there is a simple  $\mathfrak{B}$ -measurable function

$$g = \sum_{i=1}^n a_i \cdot 1_{B_i} \in C(\text{ult}(\mathfrak{B}))$$

so that  $||\mu(Z)| - \langle \mu, g \rangle| < \varepsilon$  for every  $\mu \in M$ .

*Proof:*

- The function  $\mu \mapsto |\mu(Z)|$  is continuous.
- There is  $h \in C(\text{ult}(\mathfrak{B}))$  so that  $|\mu(Z)| = \langle \mu, h \rangle$  for  $\mu \in M$ .
- Pick some simple  $\mathfrak{B}$ -measurable  $g$  so that  $\|h - g\| < \varepsilon$ . □

# The construction

 WARNING: technicalities ahead! 

# The construction

 WARNING: technicalities ahead! 

- We assume that  $0 \in \mathbb{N}$ .

# The construction

 WARNING: technicalities ahead! 

- We assume that  $0 \in \mathbb{N}$ .
- $\Delta = \{(n, k) \in \mathbb{N} \times \mathbb{N} : 0 \leq k \leq n\}$ .

# The construction

 WARNING: technicalities ahead! 

- We assume that  $0 \in \mathbb{N}$ .
- $\Delta = \{(n, k) \in \mathbb{N} \times \mathbb{N} : 0 \leq k \leq n\}$ .
- Given  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ ,  $S_n = \{(n, k) \in \Delta\}$ .

# The construction

 WARNING: technicalities ahead! 

- We assume that  $0 \in \mathbb{N}$ .
- $\Delta = \{(n, k) \in \mathbb{N} \times \mathbb{N} : 0 \leq k \leq n\}$ .
- Given  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ ,  $S_n = \{(n, k) \in \Delta\}$ .
- We aim to construct *two* almost disjoint families

$$\mathcal{A} \subseteq \mathcal{P}(\mathbb{N}) \quad , \quad \mathcal{B} \subseteq \mathcal{P}(\Delta)$$

with certain conditions.

# The construction

 WARNING: technicalities ahead! 

- We assume that  $0 \in \mathbb{N}$ .
- $\Delta = \{(n, k) \in \mathbb{N} \times \mathbb{N} : 0 \leq k \leq n\}$ .
- Given  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ ,  $S_n = \{(n, k) \in \Delta\}$ .
- We aim to construct *two* almost disjoint families

$$\mathcal{A} \subseteq \mathcal{P}(\mathbb{N}) \quad , \quad \mathcal{B} \subseteq \mathcal{P}(\Delta)$$

with certain conditions.

- Let us focus on  $\mathcal{B}$ .



# The construction

 WARNING: technicalities ahead! 

- We assume that  $0 \in \mathbb{N}$ .
- $\Delta = \{(n, k) \in \mathbb{N} \times \mathbb{N} : 0 \leq k \leq n\}$ .
- Given  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ ,  $S_n = \{(n, k) \in \Delta\}$ .
- We aim to construct *two* almost disjoint families

$$\mathcal{A} \subseteq \mathcal{P}(\mathbb{N}) \quad , \quad \mathcal{B} \subseteq \mathcal{P}(\Delta)$$

with certain conditions.

- Let us focus on  $\mathcal{B}$ .
- ...or rather, in the subalgebra  $\mathfrak{B}$  that it generates.

# Admissible sequences

$$0 \longrightarrow C(K_{\mathcal{A}}) \longrightarrow C(K_{\mathcal{B}}) \longrightarrow Z \longrightarrow 0$$

# Admissible sequences

$$0 \longrightarrow C(K_{\mathcal{A}}) \longrightarrow C(K_{\mathcal{B}}) \longrightarrow Z \longrightarrow 0$$

## Definition

Given  $0 < c \leq 1$ , a bounded sequence  $(\mu_n)_{n=1}^{\infty}$  in  $\ell_1(\Delta)$  is *c-admissible* if

- $\mu_n(S_k) = 0$  for every  $n, k \in \mathbb{N}$ .
- $|\mu_n(n, 0)| \geq c$  for every  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ .

# Admissible sequences

$$0 \longrightarrow C(K_{\mathcal{A}}) \longrightarrow C(K_{\mathcal{B}}) \longrightarrow Z \longrightarrow 0$$

## Definition

Given  $0 < c \leq 1$ , a bounded sequence  $(\mu_n)_{n=1}^{\infty}$  in  $\ell_1(\Delta)$  is *c-admissible* if

- $\mu_n(S_k) = 0$  for every  $n, k \in \mathbb{N}$ .
- $|\mu_n(n, 0)| \geq c$  for every  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ .

☞ Every  $c$ -norming set in the unit ball of  $Z^* \subseteq M(K_{\mathcal{B}}) = \ell_1(\Delta) \oplus \ell_1(\mathcal{B})$  “contains” a  $c$ -admissible sequence.

# Admissible sequences

$$0 \longrightarrow C(K_{\mathcal{A}}) \longrightarrow C(K_{\mathcal{B}}) \longrightarrow Z \longrightarrow 0$$

## Definition

Given  $0 < c \leq 1$ , a bounded sequence  $(\mu_n)_{n=1}^{\infty}$  in  $\ell_1(\Delta)$  is *c-admissible* if

- $\mu_n(S_k) = 0$  for every  $n, k \in \mathbb{N}$ .
- $|\mu_n(n, 0)| \geq c$  for every  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ .

☞ Every *c*-norming set in the unit ball of  $Z^* \subseteq M(K_{\mathcal{B}}) = \ell_1(\Delta) \oplus \ell_1(\mathcal{B})$  “contains” a *c*-admissible sequence.

## Definition

A subalgebra  $\mathfrak{B}$  *kills* a *c*-admissible sequence  $(\mu_n)_{n=1}^{\infty}$  if there is no *c*-norming free set in  $M_1(\text{ult}(\mathfrak{B}))$  containing  $(\mu_n)_{n=1}^{\infty}$ .

# How to get away with murder ( $\mathfrak{c}$ -many times)

*Plan:* construct (by induction)  $\mathfrak{B}$  so that it kills all  $\mathfrak{c}$ -admissible sequences.

# How to get away with murder ( $\mathfrak{c}$ -many times)

*Plan:* construct (by induction)  $\mathfrak{B}$  so that it kills all  $\mathfrak{c}$ -admissible sequences.

- Fix an enumeration  $\{(c_\xi, (\mu_n^\xi))_{n=1}^\infty) : \xi < \mathfrak{c}\}$ .

# How to get away with murder ( $\mathfrak{c}$ -many times)

*Plan:* construct (by induction)  $\mathfrak{B}$  so that it kills all  $\mathfrak{c}$ -admissible sequences.

- Fix an enumeration  $\{(c_\xi, (\mu_n^\xi))_{n=1}^\infty) : \xi < \mathfrak{c}\}$ .
- Step 0: let  $\mathfrak{B}_0$  be the subalgebra generated by finite sets.



# How to get away with murder ( $\mathfrak{c}$ -many times)

*Plan:* construct (by induction)  $\mathfrak{B}$  so that it kills all  $\mathfrak{c}$ -admissible sequences.

- Fix an enumeration  $\{(c_\xi, (\mu_n^\xi))_{n=1}^\infty) : \xi < \mathfrak{c}\}$ .
- Step 0: let  $\mathfrak{B}_0$  be the subalgebra generated by finite sets.
- Step  $\xi$ :
  - We have: an *intermediate subalgebra*  $\mathfrak{B} = \bigcup_{\alpha < \xi} \mathfrak{B}_\alpha$  containing finite sets of  $\Delta$  and such that  $|\mathfrak{B}| < \mathfrak{c}$ .

# How to get away with murder ( $\mathfrak{c}$ -many times)

*Plan:* construct (by induction)  $\mathfrak{B}$  so that it kills all  $\mathfrak{c}$ -admissible sequences.

- Fix an enumeration  $\{(c_\xi, (\mu_n^\xi))_{n=1}^\infty) : \xi < \mathfrak{c}\}$ .
- Step 0: let  $\mathfrak{B}_0$  be the subalgebra generated by finite sets.
- Step  $\xi$ :
  - We have: an *intermediate subalgebra*  $\mathfrak{B} = \bigcup_{\alpha < \xi} \mathfrak{B}_\alpha$  containing finite sets of  $\Delta$  and such that  $|\mathfrak{B}| < \mathfrak{c}$ .
  - We want: a bigger algebra  $\mathfrak{B}_\xi \supseteq \mathfrak{B}$  that kills  $(\mu_n^\xi)_{n=1}^\infty$ .

# How to get away with murder ( $\mathfrak{c}$ -many times)

*Plan:* construct (by induction)  $\mathfrak{B}$  so that it kills all  $\mathfrak{c}$ -admissible sequences.

- Fix an enumeration  $\{(c_\xi, (\mu_n^\xi))_{n=1}^\infty) : \xi < \mathfrak{c}\}$ .
- Step 0: let  $\mathfrak{B}_0$  be the subalgebra generated by finite sets.
- Step  $\xi$ :
  - We have: an *intermediate subalgebra*  $\mathfrak{B} = \bigcup_{\alpha < \xi} \mathfrak{B}_\alpha$  containing finite sets of  $\Delta$  and such that  $|\mathfrak{B}| < \mathfrak{c}$ .
  - We want: a bigger algebra  $\mathfrak{B}_\xi \supseteq \mathfrak{B}$  that kills  $(\mu_n^\xi)_{n=1}^\infty$ .

👉 *Aim:* given a subalgebra  $\mathfrak{B}$  with  $|\mathfrak{B}| < \mathfrak{c}$  and a  $\mathfrak{c}$ -admissible sequence  $(\mu_n)_{n=1}^\infty$ , find  $Z \subset \Delta$  so that  $\mathfrak{B}[Z]$  **kills**  $(\mu_n)_{n=1}^\infty$ .

*Notation:*  $\mathfrak{B}[Z]$  = smallest subalgebra containing  $\mathfrak{B}$  and  $Z$ .

# $\mathfrak{B}$ -separation

# $\mathfrak{B}$ -separation

Fix a subalgebra  $\mathfrak{B} \subset \mathcal{P}(\Delta)$  containing finite sets and  $|\mathfrak{B}| < \mathfrak{c}$ .

# $\mathfrak{B}$ -separation

Fix a subalgebra  $\mathfrak{B} \subset \mathcal{P}(\Delta)$  containing finite sets and  $|\mathfrak{B}| < \mathfrak{c}$ .

## Definition

Two subsets  $M, M' \subseteq M_1(\text{ult}(\mathfrak{B}))$  are  $\mathfrak{B}$ -separated if there exists  $\varepsilon > 0$  and  $B_1, \dots, B_n \in \mathfrak{B}$  so that for any pair  $(\mu, \mu') \in M \times M'$ ,  $|\mu(B_i) - \mu'(B_i)| > \varepsilon$  for some  $1 \leq i \leq n$ .

# $\mathfrak{B}$ -separation

Fix a subalgebra  $\mathfrak{B} \subset \mathcal{P}(\Delta)$  containing finite sets and  $|\mathfrak{B}| < \mathfrak{c}$ .

## Definition

Two subsets  $M, M' \subseteq M_1(\text{ult}(\mathfrak{B}))$  are  $\mathfrak{B}$ -separated if there exists  $\varepsilon > 0$  and  $B_1, \dots, B_n \in \mathfrak{B}$  so that for any pair  $(\mu, \mu') \in M \times M'$ ,  $|\mu(B_i) - \mu'(B_i)| > \varepsilon$  for some  $1 \leq i \leq n$ .

Two useful facts:

# $\mathfrak{B}$ -separation

Fix a subalgebra  $\mathfrak{B} \subset \mathcal{P}(\Delta)$  containing finite sets and  $|\mathfrak{B}| < \mathfrak{c}$ .

## Definition

Two subsets  $M, M' \subseteq M_1(\text{ult}(\mathfrak{B}))$  are  $\mathfrak{B}$ -separated if there exists  $\varepsilon > 0$  and  $B_1, \dots, B_n \in \mathfrak{B}$  so that for any pair  $(\mu, \mu') \in M \times M'$ ,  $|\mu(B_i) - \mu'(B_i)| > \varepsilon$  for some  $1 \leq i \leq n$ .

Two useful facts:

1. If there is a simple  $\mathfrak{B}$ -measurable function  $g$  so that  $|\langle \mu, g \rangle - \langle \mu', g \rangle| > \varepsilon$  for every  $\mu \in M$  and  $\mu' \in M'$ , then  $M$  and  $M'$  are  $\mathfrak{B}$ -separated.



# $\mathfrak{B}$ -separation

Fix a subalgebra  $\mathfrak{B} \subset \mathcal{P}(\Delta)$  containing finite sets and  $|\mathfrak{B}| < \mathfrak{c}$ .

## Definition

Two subsets  $M, M' \subseteq M_1(\text{ult}(\mathfrak{B}))$  are  $\mathfrak{B}$ -separated if there exists  $\varepsilon > 0$  and  $B_1, \dots, B_n \in \mathfrak{B}$  so that for any pair  $(\mu, \mu') \in M \times M'$ ,  $|\mu(B_i) - \mu'(B_i)| > \varepsilon$  for some  $1 \leq i \leq n$ .

Two useful facts:

1. If there is a simple  $\mathfrak{B}$ -measurable function  $g$  so that  $|\langle \mu, g \rangle - \langle \mu', g \rangle| > \varepsilon$  for every  $\mu \in M$  and  $\mu' \in M'$ , then  $M$  and  $M'$  are  $\mathfrak{B}$ -separated.
2. If  $M \subseteq M_1(\text{ult}(\mathfrak{B}))$  is infinite, there exists  $M' \subseteq M$  so that  $M'$  and  $M \setminus M'$  are *not*  $\mathfrak{B}$ -separated.

## How to deal with $\mathfrak{B}$ -separation

- Let  $(\mu_n)_{n=1}^{\infty}$  be a  $c$ -admissible sequence.

# How to deal with $\mathfrak{B}$ -separation

- Let  $(\mu_n)_{n=1}^{\infty}$  be a  $c$ -admissible sequence.
- Consider  $J_3 \subseteq J_2 \subseteq J_1 \subseteq \mathbb{N}$  so that the following pairs of sets are **not**  $\mathfrak{B}$ -separated:
  - $\{\mu_n : n \in J_2\}$  and  $\{\mu_n : n \in J_1 \setminus J_2\}$ .
  - $\{\mu_n : n \in J_3\}$  and  $\{\mu_n : n \in J_2 \setminus J_3\}$ .

# How to deal with $\mathfrak{B}$ -separation

- Let  $(\mu_n)_{n=1}^{\infty}$  be a  $c$ -admissible sequence.
- Consider  $J_3 \subseteq J_2 \subseteq J_1 \subseteq \mathbb{N}$  so that the following pairs of sets are **not**  $\mathfrak{B}$ -separated:
  - $\{\mu_n : n \in J_2\}$  and  $\{\mu_n : n \in J_1 \setminus J_2\}$ .
  - $\{\mu_n : n \in J_3\}$  and  $\{\mu_n : n \in J_2 \setminus J_3\}$ .
- Find a set  $Z$  so that

$$\mu_n(Z) \approx \begin{cases} c/2 & \text{if } n \in J_3 \\ -c/2 & \text{if } n \in J_2 \setminus J_3 \\ 0 & \text{if } n \in J_1 \setminus J_2 \end{cases}$$

# How to deal with $\mathfrak{B}$ -separation

- Let  $(\mu_n)_{n=1}^{\infty}$  be a  $c$ -admissible sequence.
- Consider  $J_3 \subseteq J_2 \subseteq J_1 \subseteq \mathbb{N}$  so that the following pairs of sets are **not**  $\mathfrak{B}$ -separated:
  - $\{\mu_n : n \in J_2\}$  and  $\{\mu_n : n \in J_1 \setminus J_2\}$ .
  - $\{\mu_n : n \in J_3\}$  and  $\{\mu_n : n \in J_2 \setminus J_3\}$ .
- Find a set  $Z$  so that

$$\mu_n(Z) \approx \begin{cases} c/2 & \text{if } n \in J_3 \\ -c/2 & \text{if } n \in J_2 \setminus J_3 \\ 0 & \text{if } n \in J_1 \setminus J_2 \end{cases}$$

- If  $(\mu_n)$  lies inside a free set in  $M(\text{ult}(\mathfrak{B}[Z]))$ , then

$$|\mu_n(Z)| \approx \langle \mu_n, h \rangle \quad \forall n \in \mathbb{N}$$

for some  $h = r \cdot 1_Z + g$ , where  $g$  is simple  $\mathfrak{B}$ -measurable.

# Dealing with how to deal with $\mathfrak{B}$ -separation

- Therefore

$$\langle \mu_n, g \rangle \approx \begin{cases} (1-r)c/2 & \text{if } n \in J_3 \\ (1+r)c/2 & \text{if } n \in J_2 \setminus J_3 \\ 0 & \text{if } n \in J_1 \setminus J_2 \end{cases}$$

# Dealing with how to deal with $\mathfrak{B}$ -separation

- Therefore

$$\langle \mu_n, g \rangle \approx \begin{cases} (1-r)c/2 & \text{if } n \in J_3 \\ (1+r)c/2 & \text{if } n \in J_2 \setminus J_3 \\ 0 & \text{if } n \in J_1 \setminus J_2 \end{cases}$$

- If  $r \approx 0$  then the sets  $\{\mu_n : n \in J_2\}$  and  $\{\mu_n : n \in J_1 \setminus J_2\}$  are  $\mathfrak{B}$ -separated.

# Dealing with how to deal with $\mathfrak{B}$ -separation

- Therefore

$$\langle \mu_n, g \rangle \approx \begin{cases} (1-r)c/2 & \text{if } n \in J_3 \\ (1+r)c/2 & \text{if } n \in J_2 \setminus J_3 \\ 0 & \text{if } n \in J_1 \setminus J_2 \end{cases}$$

- If  $r \approx 0$  then the sets  $\{\mu_n : n \in J_2\}$  and  $\{\mu_n : n \in J_1 \setminus J_2\}$  are  $\mathfrak{B}$ -separated.
- If  $|r| \gg 0$  then the sets  $\{\mu_n : n \in J_3\}$  and  $\{\mu_n : n \in J_2 \setminus J_3\}$  are  $\mathfrak{B}$ -separated.



...Is that all?

...Is that all?

We have killed the  $\xi$ -th admissible sequence...

# ...Is that all?

We have killed the  $\xi$ -th admissible sequence...  
...but the **previous sequences** may now lie inside a free set.

## ...Is that all?

We have killed the  $\xi$ -th admissible sequence...  
...but the **previous sequences** may now lie inside a free set.

### Key Lemma 2

Suppose we have

- A subalgebra  $\mathfrak{B} \subseteq \mathcal{P}(\Delta)$  containing finite sets and  $|\mathfrak{B}| < \mathfrak{c}$ .
- A collection of pairs of non- $\mathfrak{B}$ -separated subsets of  $M_1(\text{ult}(\mathfrak{B}))$   $\{(M_\alpha, M'_\alpha) : \alpha < \xi\}$ ,  $\xi < \mathfrak{c}$ .

Then for every almost disjoint family  $\mathcal{Z}$  of size  $\mathfrak{c}$  there is  $Z \in \mathcal{Z}$  so that  $M_\alpha$  and  $M'_\alpha$  are not  $\mathfrak{B}[Z]$ -separated for every  $\alpha < \kappa$ .

# Open problems

# Open problems

## 1. *An Amir-Cambern theorem?*

Our counterexample  $Z$  is 2-complemented in a  $\mathcal{C}$ -space.

# Open problems

## 1. *An Amir-Cambern theorem?*

Our counterexample  $Z$  is 2-complemented in a  $\mathcal{C}$ -space.  
What about 1-complemented?

# Open problems

1. *An Amir-Cambern theorem?*

Our counterexample  $Z$  is 2-complemented in a  $\mathcal{C}$ -space.  
What about 1-complemented?

2. *A stronger counterexample*

Is there a  $C(K)$  so that  $C(K) = Z \oplus Z'$  where both  $Z$  and  $Z'$  are not  $\mathcal{C}$ -spaces?



Thank you very much  
for your attention!